

York Catholic District School Board

Catholic Education Centre, 320 Bloomington Road West, Aurora, Ontario L4G 0M1
Tel: 905-713-1211, 416-221-5051, 1-800-363-2711
Fax: 905-713-1272 • www.ycdsb.ca

Elizabeth Crowe

Chair Aurora/King Whitchurch Stouffville

Theresa McNicol

East Gwillimbury/ Georgina/Newmarket

Carol Cotton

Markham Area 1, Wards 1, 2, 3, 6

Frank Alexander

Markham Area 2, Wards 4, 5, 7, 8

Dominic Mazzotta

Richmond Hill

Maria lafrate

Richmond Hill

Rose Cantisano

Vaughan Area 1, Ward 1

Dino Giuliani

Vaughan Area 2, Ward 2

Maria Marchese

Vice-Chair Vaughan Area 3, Ward 3

Jennifer Wigston

Vaughan, Area 4. Wards 4. 5

Alessandro Casbarro

Sr. Student Trustee

Anthea Peta-Dragos

Jr. Student Trustee

December 3, 2021

Email Address: chair@metrolinx.com

Mr. Donald Wright, Chair Metrolinx 97 Front Street West Toronto, Ontario M5.J 1E6

Dear Mr. Wright:

Metrolinx has identified the **Option 3 Revised** alignment as the preferred route for the Yonge North Subway Extension. This route results in two subway tunnels directly beneath St. Anthony Catholic Elementary School in Thornhill. St. Anthony CES will be the first elementary school in the province to have a subway directly beneath it, and we are exceedingly concerned that the implications of constructing and operating two subway tunnels below an elementary school have not been adequately considered.

The York Catholic District School Board is strongly opposed to the proposed alignment as illustrated in the Option 3 Refined. We are, therefore, asking Metrolinx to take a step back and reconsider their preferred alignment, recognizing that the St. Anthony CES **school site** is a sensitive land use. We are asking Metrolinx to acknowledge that impacting this school affects more than 230 students, their families and its dedicated staff. Unlike a store, park or place of worship, students do not have the choice to attend an alternate location if they or their families are concerned with risks associated with a subway running beneath their school.

In the event that, after this review, Option 3 Refined remains as the alignment, the Board has the following requirements as it pertains to our property at 141 Kirk Drive, St. Anthony, Catholic Elementary School:

- 1. That the tunnel alignment on the school site be moved slightly (approximately 50m 100m) to be located under the playing fields as opposed to under the building itself.
- 2. That any borehole drilling be conducted after school hours, utilizing holidays and weekends with appropriate noise attenuation to minimize disruption to neighbours.
- 3. That Emergency Exit Buildings NOT be located on the school site.

As a school board we have a site acquisition policy which requires prudent avoidance from highway approaches, transmission corridors, flight paths, etc. (parameter 3.6.4(v)).

3.6.4 School sites shall be located in consultation with the local municipality, in order to ensure:

aoi to oiloaio.								
3.6.4 (i)	reasonable	access	in	terms	of	public	and pr	ivate
	transportation	n, time a	nd d	istance	·.			
3.6.4 (ii)	freedom from excessive noise;							
3.6.4 (iii)	freedom from noxious gases and fumes;							
3.6.4 (iv)	freedom from danger to pedestrian safety;							
3.6.4 (v)	prudent avo	idance o	f hi	ghway	appr	oaches,	airports	and

prudent avoidance of highway approaches, airports and flight paths, transmission corridors including hydro and natural gas, and commercial or industrial development.

Source: YCDSB Policy 707: Acquisition and Development of School sites

The YCDSB would not knowingly propose or construct a school site above a subway tunnel given potential or even perceived risks to our students' safety and well-being. The children in our care are one of the most vulnerable sectors of our community, and as a school board we are required to provide a higher standard duty of care and protection for students. That duty of care is challenged by the possibility of the subway tunnels, the associated site work required, and the potential of related infrastructure such as Emergency Exit Buildings or venting.

In our discussions with Metrolinx representatives we have been assured that vibration and sound will be mitigated and modern technologies employed on this line will ensure there will be no disruption to the school during operation of the subway. The Schulich School of Business at York University has been suggested as the closest example to what can be expected beneath St. Anthony, however, respectfully, there are a number of key differences with the Schulich School of Business building namely:

- The Schulich School of Business building is 15 to 18 years old, whereas St. Anthony CES was built more than 50 years ago;
- The Schulich School of Business building houses adults whereas St. Anthony CES is a K-8 school, home to students ages 3 - 14 years old;
- The tunnel beneath the Schulich School of Business building is straight and at a level grade, whereas the proposed tunnel below St. Anthony CES will change grades and be curved;
- The station box is within close proximity to the Schulich School of Business building, therefore the trains are likely travelling at lower speeds than they would below St. Anthony CES.

In addition to possible disruption, the Board is concerned about ongoing safety of the students and staff at the school if the tunnels were to be located under the school. We are aware that in other jurisdictions, specifically Amsterdam and Cologne, there have been tunnel failures during subway construction as well as some subways have been the target of terrorist activity. Metrolinx itself has denied a Freedom of Information request from the Royal Orchard Community citing among other reasons Section 16 of the Freedom of Information and Protection of Privacy Act. Section 16 of the Act References National Security, and the prevention or suppression of espionage, sabotage or terrorism.

Thank you for your attention to this matter.

Yours truly,

Elizabeth Crowe

Elizabeth Come

Chair of the Board, York Catholic District School Board

c.c. YCDSB Board of Trustees