Appendix A7-3 Cultural Heritage Evaluation Recommendations Report: Farewell Street Bridge



Final Report

August 24, 2023

Prepared for:

Metrolinx 20 Bay Street, 6th Floor Toronto, Ontario M5J 2W3

Prepared by:

Stantec Consulting Ltd. 600-171 Queens Avenue London, ON N6A 5J7

Project Number: 165011019

August 24, 2023

Executive Summary

Metrolinx retained Stantec Consulting Ltd. (Stantec) to prepare a Cultural Heritage Evaluation Report (CHER) for the Farewell Street Multi-Use Bridge located in the City of Oshawa, regional Municipality of Durham. The CHER is divided into two reports, the Cultural Heritage Evaluation Report and the Cultural Heritage Evaluation Recommendations Report. The Farewell Street Multi-Use Bridge was identified as a potential cultural heritage resource in the Cultural Heritage Report: Existing Conditions Report and Preliminary Impact Assessment for the Oshawa to Bowmanville Rail Service Extension Project. The Farewell Street Multi-Use Bridge will be replaced as part of the proposed undertaking of the project. This CHER was prepared according to the Metrolinx Draft Terms of Reference for Consultants: Cultural Heritage Evaluation Report and Cultural Heritage Evaluation Report Recommendations.

This report, the Cultural Heritage Evaluation Recommendation Report (CHERR) evaluates the Farewell Street Multi-Use Bridge against the criteria of *Ontario Regulation 9/06* (O. Reg. 9/06)¹ and *Ontario Regulation 10/06* (O. Reg. 10/06) (Government of Ontario 2023; Government of Ontario 2006). The CHERR provides recommendations to the Metrolinx Heritage Committee regarding the level of cultural heritage significance (if any) of the potential resource. The CHERR was prepared by Frank Smith, MA, CAHP Cultural Heritage Specialist and Meaghan Rivard, MA, CAHP, Senior Cultural Heritage Specialist.

The Farewell Street Multi-Use Bridge is a timber stringer bridge that was built *circa* 1912 when the Canadian Pacific Railway (CPR) was constructed through the present-day City of Oshawa. The bridge is located in a suburban area of Oshawa on Farewell Street between Elmridge Drive and Keates Avenue and is currently open for pedestrian use only. The bridge is a rare surviving example of a timber bridge within the City of Oshawa and Regional Municipality of Durham. By the mid-20th century timber bridges were increasingly supplanted by steel and concrete bridges and were relegated to rural areas and northern Ontario. These bridges have been increasingly replaced in the Regional Municipality of Durham as development encroaches upon formerly agricultural land.

A provincial heritage property (PHP) is a property that meets one or more criteria of O. Reg. 9/06, and a provincial heritage property of provincial significance (PHPPS) must meet one or more criteria of O. Reg. 10/06, regardless of the criteria met under O. Reg. 9/06.

Based on the evaluation of the Farewell Street Multi-Use Bridge against O. Reg. 9/06 and O. Reg. 10/06 it is recommended that the Farewell Street Multi-Use Bridge be considered a PHP as it meets one criterion of O. Reg. 9/06. The evaluation concluded that the Farewell Street Multi-Use Bridge is a rare surviving example of a timber stringer bridge along the

¹ In 2023, O. Reg. 9/06 was amended by O. Reg. 569/22 (Government of Ontario 2023).



i

August 24, 2023

CPR line in the City of Oshawa and Regional Municipality of Durham. Therefore, the CHER recommends that the Farewell Street Multi-Use Bridge be deemed a PHP.

In 2022, The Metrolinx Heritage Committee (MHC) made an interim decision that the Farewell Street Multi-Use Bridge is a Provincial Heritage Property (PHP). This will be confirmed by MHC once Metrolinx owns, manages or controls the structure.

The Executive Summary highlights key points from the report only; for complete information and findings, the reader should examine the complete report.

Document History

Revision	Description	Author	Quality Reviewer	Independent Reviewer	
1 November 12, 2021	Draft report	Frank Smith	David Waverman	Tracie Carmichael	
2 May 5, 2022	Revisions to draft report	Frank Smith	David Waverman	Tracie Carmichael	
3 July 26, 2022	Revisions to draft report	Frank Smith	David Waverman	Tracie Carmichael	
4 August 26, 2022	Revisions to draft report	Frank Smith	David Waverman	Tracie Carmichael	
5 June 1, 2023	Revisions to draft report	Frank Smith	Lashia Jones	Tracie Carmichael	
5 June 23, 2023	Revisions to draft report	Frank Smith	Lashia Jones	Tracie Carmichael	
6 August 24, 2023	Final	Frank Smith	Lashia Jones	Colin Varley	



Table of Contents

Execu	ıtive Summary	İ
Table	of Contentsi	ii
Projec	ct Personneli	٧
Abbre	eviations	٧
1.0	Introduction	1
2.0 2.1 2.2 2.3	Evaluation Ontario Regulation 9/06 Ontario Regulation 10/06. Recommended Outcome of Evaluation	2 4
3.0 3.1 3.2 3.3	Draft Statement of Cultural Heritage Value or Interest Description of the Property Cultural Heritage Value Heritage Attributes.	7 7
4.0	Closure	8
5.0	References	9
List o	f Tables	
Table Table	1: O. Reg 9/06 Evaluation	



August 24, 2023

Project Personnel

Project Manager: Alex Blasko, B.Sc. (Hon.)

Heritage Consultant: Meaghan Rivard, MA, CAHP

Report Writer: Frank Smith, MA, CAHP

GIS Specialist: Brian Cowper

Administrative Assistant: Sarah Hilker

Quality Reviewer: David Waverman OALA, CSLA, CAHP

Lashia Jones, MA, CAHP

Independent Reviewer: Colin Varley, MA, RPA



Abbreviations

CAHP Canadian Association of Heritage Professionals

CHER Cultural Heritage Evaluation Report

CHERR Cultural Heritage Evaluation Recommendation Report

CHVI Cultural Heritage Value or Interest

CPR Canadian Pacific Railway

MA Master of Arts

MCM Ministry of Citizenship and Multiculturalism

MHC Metrolinx Heritage Committee

OHA Ontario Heritage Act

O. Reg. Ontario Regulation

PHP Provincial Heritage Property

PHPSS Provincial Heritage Property of Provincial Significance



August 24, 2023

1.0 Introduction

Stantec Consulting Ltd. (Stantec) was retained by Metrolinx to prepare a Cultural Heritage Evaluation Report (CHER) for the Farewell Street Multi-Use Bridge in the City of Oshawa, Regional Municipality of Durham. The CHER is divided into two reports, the Cultural Heritage Evaluation Report and the Cultural Heritage Evaluation Recommendations Report. The Farewell Street Multi-Use Bridge was identified as a potential cultural heritage resource in the Addendum to Oshawa to Bowmanville Rail Service Extension: Cultural Heritage Report—Existing Conditions and Preliminary Impact Assessment (Stantec 2021).

The CHER was prepared in accordance with the *Draft Metrolinx Terms of Reference for Cultural Heritage Evaluation Reports and Cultural Heritage Evaluation Report Recommendations* and the Ministry of Citizenship and Multiculturalism (MCM) *Standards and Guidelines for the Conservation of Provincial Heritage* (Metrolinx 2016; MCM 2010).

This report, the Cultural Heritage Evaluation Recommendation Report (CHERR) evaluates the Farewell Street Multi-Use Bridge against the criteria of *Ontario Regulation 9/06* (O. Reg 9/06)² and *Ontario Regulation 10/06* (O. Reg 10/06) (Government of Ontario 2023; Government of Ontario 2006). The CHERR provides recommendations to the Metrolinx Heritage Committee regarding the level of cultural heritage significance (if any) of the potential resource.

The Farewell Street Multi-Use Bridge is a five span timber stringer bridge that was built *circa* 1912 when the Canadian Pacific Railway (CPR) was constructed through the present-day City of Oshawa. The bridge is located in a suburban area of Oshawa on Farewell Street between Elmridge Drive and Keates Avenue and is currently open for pedestrian use only. The bridge is a rare surviving example of a timber bridge within the City of Oshawa and Regional Municipality of Durham. By the mid-20th century timber bridges were increasingly supplanted by steel and concrete bridges and were relegated to rural areas and northern Ontario. These bridges have been increasingly replaced in the Regional Municipality of Durham as development encroaches upon formerly agricultural land.

² In 2023, O. Reg. 9/06 was amended by O. Reg. 569/22 (Government of Ontario 2023)



1

2.0 Evaluation

2.1 Ontario Regulation 9/06

Table 1 provides the findings of the evaluation according to O. Reg. 9/06. A discussion of the design/physical value, historical and associative value, and contextual value of the Farewell Street Multi-Use Bridge is contained in the CHER.

Table 1: O. Reg 9/06 Evaluation

	riteria of O. Reg. 9/06 nded by O. Reg. 569/22)	Yes/No	Comments
rep exa exp	a rare, unique, presentative, or early ample of a style, type, pression, material, or estruction method	Yes	The Farewell Street Multi-Use Bridge is a rare surviving example of a timber stringer bridge along the CPR line in the City of Oshawa and Regional Municipality of Durham. Timber stringer bridges are among the oldest types of bridges in the world and were some of the first types of bridges built in North America. Although surpassed in popularity by iron, steel, and concrete bridges in the late 19 th to early 20 th century, these types of bridges remained on low trafficked rural roads. As suburban development encroached upon formerly rural and agricultural lands in the Regional Municipality of Durham, timber bridges along the CPR tracks have been increasingly replaced.
	splays a high degree of aftsmanship or artistic erit	No	The Farewell Street Multi-Use Bridge is a utilitarian structure designed to carry rural traffic. It demonstrates a level of craftsmanship typical of timber stringer bridges and contains no artistic embellishments.
of t	emonstrates a high degree technical or scientific hievement	No	The timber stringer bridge is among the oldest bridge types in the world. The bridge was constructed as bridge design was moving away from timber bridges and towards steel and concrete. Therefore, the bridge does not demonstrate a high degree of technical or scientific achievement.



August 24, 2023

Criteria of O. Reg. 9/06 (amended by O. Reg. 569/22)		Yes/No	Comments
4.	Has direct associations with a theme, event, belief, person, activity, organization, or institution that is significant to a community	No	The bridge is associated with the CPR, which was built through the area in 1912. The CPR was not the first railway to arrive in the area and was located relatively close to the existing Grand Trunk Railway trackage. Therefore, the bridge is not associated with an organization significant to the pattern of development of Oshawa or the former Township of East Whitby.
5.	Yields, or has the potential to yield, information that contributes to an understanding of a community or culture	No	The Farewell Street Multi-Use Bridge is a utilitarian timber stringer bridge. These types of bridges were formerly widespread, and the bridge does not offer new knowledge or a greater understanding of the CPR, Oshawa, or the former Township of East Whitby.
6.	Demonstrates or reflects the work or ideas of an architect, artist, builder, designer, or theorist who is significant to a community	No	The architect, builder, or designer of the Farewell Street Multi-Use Bridge is unknown.
7.	Is important in defining, maintaining, or supporting the character of an area	No	The Farewell Street Multi-Use Bridge is set in a suburban streetscape and stands in contrast to the surrounding area.
8.	Is physically, functionally, visually, or historically linked to its surroundings	No	The Farewell Street Multi-Use Bridge is an element of the CPR trackage through the City of Oshawa, but it was built to serve the functional purpose of spanning the railway cut of the CPR due to natural topography which precluded an at-grade crossing. Therefore, it is not linked to its surroundings from a cultural heritage perspective.
9.	Is a landmark	No	Located setback from the roadway and within a low traffic suburban neighbourhood, the bridge is not especially discernible or memorable. The large and impressive timber piers of the bridge are not visible from the roadway and only part of the deck is



Criteria of O. Reg. 9/06 (amended by O. Reg. 569/22)	Yes/No	Comments
		visible along Farewell Street. Therefore, the bridge is not a landmark.

2.2 Ontario Regulation 10/06

Table 2 provides the findings of the evaluation according to O. Reg. 10/06. A discussion of Farewell Street Multi-Use Bridge which includes a provincial context is included in the CHER.

Table 2: O. Reg. 10/06 Evaluation

	Criteria in O. Reg. 10/06	Yes/No	Comments
1.	The property represents or demonstrates a theme or pattern in Ontario's history.	No	The Farewell Street Multi-Use Bridge was constructed to service a rural road that could not accommodate an at grade crossing due to topography. Although associated with the transportation history of Ontario, the bridge itself does not demonstrate this theme in any particular way given its generic and formerly common design.
2.	The property yields, or has the potential to yield, information that contributes to an understanding of Ontario's history.	No	The Farewell Street Multi-Use Bridge is a utilitarian bridge designed to service a rural road. It does not yield or have the potential to yield information that contributes to an understanding of Ontario's history.
3.	The property demonstrates an uncommon, rare or unique aspect of Ontario's cultural heritage.	No	While increasingly rare in the Regional Municipality of Durham and City of Oshawa, timber bridges remain in service throughout Ontario, especially in more northern remote regions.
4.	The property is of aesthetic, visual or contextual importance to the province.	No	The Farewell Street Multi-Use Bridge is a utilitarian structure and was not designed or found to contain aesthetic value, symbolic value, or evoke an emotional response.



August 24, 2023

	Criteria in O. Reg. 10/06	Yes/No	Comments
5.	The property demonstrates a high degree of excellence or creative, technical or scientific achievement at a provincial level in a given period.	No	The timber stringer bridge is among the oldest bridge types in the world. Therefore, the bridge does not demonstrate a high degree of technical or scientific achievement at the provincial level.
6.	The property has a strong or special association with the entire province or with a community that is found in more than one part of the province. The association exists for historic, social, or cultural reasons or because of traditional use.	No	Farewell Street Multi-Use Bridge is not associated with a specific community or with traditional use of any kind. It is a utilitarian structure and not designed with symbolic or spiritual meaning.
7.	The property has a strong or special association with the life or work of a person, group or organization of importance to the province or with an event of importance to the province.	No	The architect or designer of the bridge is unknown.
8.	The property is located in unorganized territory and the Minister determines that there is a provincial interest in the protection of the property.	No	The property is located in the City of Oshawa, a lower-tier municipality within the Regional Municipality of Durham.

2.3 Recommended Outcome of Evaluation

A provincial heritage property (PHP) is a property that meets one or more criteria of O. Reg. 9/06, and a provincial heritage property of provincial significance (PHPPS) must meet one or more criteria of O. Reg. 10/06, regardless of the criteria met under O. Reg. 9/06.

Based on the evaluation of the Farewell Street Multi-Use Bridge against O. Reg. 9/06 and O. Reg. 10/06 it is recommended that the Farewell Street Multi-Use Bridge be considered a PHP as it meets one criterion of O. Reg. 9/06. The evaluation concluded that the Farewell Street Multi-Use Bridge is a rare surviving example of a timber stringer bridge along the CPR line in the City of Oshawa and Regional Municipality of Durham. Therefore, the CHER recommends that the Farewell Street Multi-Use Bridge be deemed a PHP.



August 24, 2023

In 2022, The Metrolinx Heritage Committee (MHC) made an interim decision that the Farewell Street Multi-Use Bridge is a Provincial Heritage Property (PHP). This will be confirmed by MHC once Metrolinx owns, manages or controls the structure.



3.0 Draft Statement of Cultural Heritage Value or Interest

3.1 Description of the Property

Located in the City of Oshawa, in Regional Municipality of Durham, the Farewell Street Multi-Use Bridge is located between Keates Avenue and Elmridge Street. The bridge spans the Canadian Pacific Railway (CPR) tracks and is a former alignment of Farewell Street that is now open to pedestrian traffic only. The bridge is a five span timber stringer bridge located in a suburban area.

3.2 Cultural Heritage Value

The Farewell Street Multi-Use Bridge was constructed *circa* 1912 when the CPR was built through present-day Oshawa. The Farewell Street Multi-Use Bridge is a rare surviving example of a timber stringer bridge along the CPR line in the City of Oshawa and Regional Municipality of Durham. Timber stringer bridges are among the oldest types of bridges in the world and were some of the first types of bridges built in North America. Although surpassed in popularity by iron, steel, and concrete bridges in the late 19th to early 20th century, these types of bridges remained on low trafficked rural roads. During the mid-20th century to present day, suburban development has increasingly encroached upon formerly agricultural lands and as a result remaining timber bridges along the CPR tracks have been increasingly replaced.

3.3 Heritage Attributes

- Five span timber stringer bridge design
- Bridge superstructure, including:
 - Laminated timber deck
 - Timber curb
 - Longitudinal timber floor beams
- · Bridge substructure, including
 - Transverse timber beams
 - Timber piers
 - Timber abutments
 - Timber wingwalls



August 24, 2023

4.0 Closure

This report has been prepared for the sole benefit of the Metrolinx and may not be used by any third party without the express written consent of Stantec Consulting Ltd. Any use which a third party makes of this report is the responsibility of such third party.

We trust this report meets your current requirements. Please do not hesitate to contact us should you require further information or have additional questions about any facet of this report.

Stantec Consulting Ltd.

Digitally signed by Meaghan Rivard Date: 2023.09.22

10:49:14 -04'00'

Meaghan Rivard MA, CAHP Senior Heritage Consultant Cell: (226) 268-9025

meaghan.rivard@stantec.com

Digitally signed by Colin Varley Date: 2023.09.21 18:07:15 -04'00'

Colin Varley MA, RPA Senior Archaeologist Cell: (613) 293-3035

Colin.varley@stantec.com



August 24, 2023

5.0 References

- Government of Ontario. 2006. O. Reg. 10/06 Criteria for Determining Cultural Heritage Value or Interest of Provincial Significance. Electronic Document: https://www.ontario.ca/laws/regulation/060010. Last accessed: January 20, 2023.
- Government of Ontario. 2023. O. Reg. 9/06 Criteria for Determining Cultural Heritage Value or Interest (amended by O. Reg 569/22). Electronic Document: https://www.ontario.ca/laws/regulation/060009. Last accessed: January 20, 2023.
- Metrolinx. 2016. Draft Terms of Reference for Consultants: Cultural Heritage Evaluation Report and Cultural Heritage Evaluation Report Recommendations. On File at Stantec.
- Ministry of Citizenship and Multiculturalism (MCM). 2010. Standards & Guidelines for Conservation of Provincial Heritage Properties. Electronic Document: http://www.mtc.gov.on.ca/en/publications/Standards_Conservation.pdf Last accessed: October 22, 2021.
- Stantec. 2023. Addendum to Oshawa to Bowmanville Service Expansion: Cultural Heritage Report—Existing Conditions and Preliminary Impact Assessment. On File at Metrolinx.

