

*Appendix A7-5
Cultural Heritage Evaluation
Recommendations Report: Albert
Street Bridge*





**Addendum to Oshawa to
Bowmanville Rail Service
Extension Project: Cultural
Heritage Evaluation
Recommendations Report—
Albert Street Bridge**
Final Report

August 24, 2023

Prepared for:

Metrolinx
20 Bay Street, 6th Floor
Toronto, Ontario M5J 2W3

Prepared by:

Stantec Consulting Ltd.
600-171 Queens Avenue
London, ON N6A 5J7

Project Number: 165011019

Executive Summary

Metrolinx retained Stantec Consulting Ltd. (Stantec) to prepare a Cultural Heritage Evaluation Report (CHER) for the Albert Street Bridge located in the City of Oshawa, Regional Municipality of Durham. The CHER is divided into two reports, the Cultural Heritage Evaluation Report and the Cultural Heritage Evaluation Recommendations Report. The Albert Street Bridge is a Class A Listed Resource on the *Heritage Oshawa Inventory* and was identified as a potential cultural heritage resource in the Cultural Heritage Report: Existing Conditions Report and Preliminary Impact Assessment for the Oshawa to Bowmanville Rail Service Extension. Metrolinx is proposing that the Albert Street Bridge be removed. This CHER was prepared according to the Metrolinx *Draft Terms of Reference for Consultants: Cultural Heritage Evaluation Report and Cultural Heritage Evaluation Report Recommendations*.

This report, the Cultural Heritage Evaluation Recommendation Report (CHERR) evaluates the Albert Street Bridge against the criteria of *Ontario Regulation 9/06* (O. Reg. 9/06)¹ and *Ontario Regulation 10/06* (O. Reg. 10/06) (Government of Ontario 2023; Government of Ontario 2006). The CHERR provides recommendations to the Metrolinx Heritage Committee regarding the level of cultural heritage significance (if any) of the potential resource. The CHERR was prepared by Frank Smith, MA, CAHP, Cultural Heritage Specialist and Meaghan Rivard, MA, CAHP, Senior Cultural Heritage Specialist.

The Albert Street Bridge is a hybrid bridge combining both the timber stringer bridge design and plate girder bridge design. The timber stringer sections of the bridge were likely built *circa* 1912 and the plate girder sections of the bridge were likely built *circa* 1957. The bridge is located in the City of Oshawa in an urban area between Albany Avenue and Olive Avenue. The Albert Street Bridge is a rare surviving example of a hybrid bridge combining both the timber stringer bridge design and plate girder bridge design. By the mid-20th century, the timber stringer design was largely surpassed by concrete and steel, while the plate girder design remained popular.

A provincial heritage property (PHP) is a property that meets one or more criteria of O. Reg. 9/06, and a provincial heritage property of provincial significance (PHPPS) must meet one or more criteria of O. Reg. 10/06, regardless of the criteria met under O. Reg. 9/06.

¹ In 2023, O. Reg. 9/06 was amended by O. Reg. 569/22 (Government of Ontario 2023)



Addendum to Oshawa to Bowmanville Rail Service Extension Project: Cultural Heritage Evaluation Recommendations Report—Albert Street Bridge
Executive Summary
 August 24, 2023

Based on the evaluation of the Albert Street Bridge against O. Reg. 9/06 and O. Reg. 10/06 it is recommended that the Albert Street Bridge be considered a PHP as it meets two criteria of O. Reg. 9/06. The evaluation concluded that the Albert Street Bridge is a rare surviving example of a hybrid bridge that combines both the timber stringer bridge design and plate girder bridge design. The bridge is also a landmark within the community. Therefore, the CHER recommends that the Albert Street Bridge be deemed a PHP.

In 2022, The Metrolinx Heritage Committee (MHC) made an interim decision that the Albert Street Bridge is a Provincial Heritage Property (PHP). This will be confirmed by MHC once Metrolinx owns, manages or controls the structure.

The Executive Summary highlights key points from the report only; for complete information and findings, the reader should examine the complete report.

Document History

Revision	Description	Author	Quality Reviewer	Independent Reviewer
1 November 12, 2021	Draft report	Frank Smith	David Waverman	Tracie Carmichael
2 May 5, 2022	Revisions to draft report	Frank Smith	David Waverman	Tracie Carmichael
3 July 26, 2022	Revisions to draft report	Frank Smith	David Waverman	Tracie Carmichael
4 August 26, 2022	Revisions to draft report	Frank Smith	David Waverman	Tracie Carmichael
5 June 1, 2023	Revisions to draft report	Frank Smith	Lashia Jones	Meaghan Rivard
6 August 24, 2024	Final Report	Frank Smith	Lashia Jones	Meaghan Rivard



Table of Contents

Executive Summary	i
Project Personnel	iv
Abbreviations	v
1.0 Introduction	1
2.0 Evaluation	2
2.1 Ontario Regulation 9/06	2
2.2 Ontario Regulation 10/06.....	4
2.3 Recommended Outcome of Evaluation	6
3.0 Draft Statement of Cultural Heritage Value or Interest	7
3.1 Description of the Property	7
3.2 Statement of Cultural Heritage Value	7
3.3 Heritage Attributes.....	8
4.0 Closure	9
5.0 References	10
List Of Tables	
Table 1: O. Reg 9/06 Evaluation.....	2
Table 2: O. Reg. 10/06 Evaluation.....	4



**Addendum to Oshawa to Bowmanville Rail Service Extension Project: Cultural Heritage
Evaluation Recommendations Report—Albert Street Bridge**

Project Personnel

August 24, 2023

Project Personnel

Project Manager:	Alex Blasko, B.Sc. (Hon.)
Heritage Consultant:	Meaghan Rivard, MA, CAHP
Report Writer:	Frank Smith, MA, CAHP
GIS Specialist:	Brian Cowper
Administrative Assistant:	Sarah Hilker
Quality Reviewer:	David Waverman OALA, CSLA, CAHP Lashia Jones, MA, CAHP
Independent Reviewer:	Tracie Carmichael, BA, B.Ed.



**Addendum to Oshawa to Bowmanville Rail Service Extension Project: Cultural Heritage Evaluation
Recommendations Report—Albert Street Bridge**

Abbreviations

August 24, 2023

Abbreviations

CAHP	Canadian Association of Heritage Professionals
CHER	Cultural Heritage Evaluation Report
CHERR	Cultural Heritage Evaluation Recommendation Report
CHVI	Cultural Heritage Value or Interest
CPR	Canadian Pacific Railway
MA	Master of Arts
MCM	Ministry of Citizenship and Multiculturalism
MHC	Metrolinx Heritage Committee
OHA	Ontario Heritage Act
O. Reg.	Ontario Regulation
PHP	Provincial Heritage Property
PHPSS	Provincial Heritage Property of Provincial Significance



1.0 Introduction

Stantec Consulting Ltd. (Stantec) was retained by Metrolinx to prepare a Cultural Heritage Evaluation Report (CHER) for the Albert Street Bridge in the City of Oshawa, Regional Municipality of Durham. The CHER is divided into two reports, the Cultural Heritage Evaluation Report and the Cultural Heritage Evaluation Recommendations Report. The Albert Street Bridge is a Class A Listed Resource on the *Heritage Oshawa Inventory* and was identified as a potential cultural heritage resource in the Cultural Heritage Existing Conditions Report and Preliminary Impact Assessment for the Oshawa to Bowmanville Rail Service Extension. Metrolinx is proposing that the Albert Street Bridge be removed.

The CHER was prepared in accordance with the *Draft Metrolinx Terms of Reference for Cultural Heritage Evaluation Reports and Cultural Heritage Evaluation Report Recommendations* and the Ministry of Citizenship and Multiculturalism (MCM) *Standards and Guidelines for the Conservation of Provincial Heritage* (Metrolinx 2016; MCM 2010).

This report, the Cultural Heritage Evaluation Recommendation Report (CHERR) evaluates the Albert Street Bridge against the criteria of *Ontario Regulation 9/06*² (O. Reg. 9/06) and *Ontario Regulation 10/06* (O. Reg. 10/06) (Government of Ontario 2023; Government of Ontario 2006). The CHERR provides recommendations to the Metrolinx Heritage Committee regarding the level of cultural heritage significance (if any) of the potential resource.

The Albert Street Bridge is a hybrid bridge combining both the timber stringer bridge design and plate girder bridge design. The timber stringer sections of the bridge were likely built *circa* 1912 and the plate girder sections of the bridge were likely built in 1957. The bridge is located in the City of Oshawa in an urban area between Albany Avenue and Olive Avenue. The Albert Street Bridge is a rare surviving example of a hybrid bridge combining both the timber stringer bridge design and plate girder bridge design. By the mid-20th century the timber stringer design was largely surpassed by concrete and steel, while the plate girder design remained popular.

² In 2023, O. Reg. 9/06 was amended by O. Reg. 569/22 (Government of Ontario 2023)



2.0 Evaluation

2.1 Ontario Regulation 9/06

Table 1 provides the findings of the evaluation according to O. Reg. 9/06. A discussion of the design/physical value, historical and associative value, and contextual value of the Albert Street Bridge is contained in the CHER.

Table 1: O. Reg 9/06 Evaluation

Criteria of O. Reg. 9/06 (amended by O. Reg. 569/22)	Yes/No	Comments
1. Is a rare, unique, representative, or early example of a style, type, expression, material, or construction method	Yes	The Albert Street Bridge is a hybrid bridge combining both the timber stringer bridge design and plate girder bridge design. The Albert Street Bridge is a rare surviving example of a hybrid bridge combining both the timber stringer bridge design and plate girder bridge design. By the mid-20 th century, the timber stringer design was largely surpassed by concrete and steel, while the plate girder design remained popular.
2. Displays a high degree of craftsmanship or artistic merit	No	The Albert Street Bridge is a utilitarian structure designed to carry pedestrian and vehicular traffic. It demonstrates a level of craftsmanship typical of timber stringer bridges and plate girder bridges. The bridge contains no artistic embellishments.
3. Demonstrates a high degree of technical or scientific achievement	No	Both the timber stringer sections of the bridge and plate girder sections of the bridge do not demonstrate any breakthroughs in construction techniques or design. The bridge demonstrates early and mid-20 th century industry standard designs.



Addendum to Oshawa to Bowmanville Rail Service Extension Project: Cultural Heritage Evaluation Recommendations Report—Albert Street Bridge Evaluation

August 24, 2023

Criteria of O. Reg. 9/06 (amended by O. Reg. 569/22)	Yes/No	Comments
4. Has direct associations with a theme, event, belief, person, activity, organization, or institution that is significant to a community	No	The bridge is associated with the CPR, which was built through the area in 1912. The CPR was not the first railway to arrive in the area and was located relatively close to the existing Grand Trunk Railway trackage. Therefore, the bridge is not associated with an organization significant to the pattern of development of Oshawa.
5. Yields, or has the potential to yield, information that contributes to an understanding of a community or culture	No	The Albert Street Bridge is a utilitarian hybrid bridge with timber stringer and plate girder sections. This type of hybrid bridge was formerly common, and the bridge does not offer new knowledge or a greater understanding of the CPR or Oshawa.
6. Demonstrates or reflects the work or ideas of an architect, artist, builder, designer, or theorist who is significant to a community	No	The architect, builder, or designer of the Albert Street Bridge is unknown.
7. Is important in defining, maintaining, or supporting the character of an area	No	The Albert Street Bridge is set in an urban landscape containing a mix of residential, commercial, and industrial properties dating from the late 19 th to mid-20 th centuries. This varied character is not particularly unique or definable.
8. Is physically, functionally, visually, or historically linked to its surroundings	No	The Albert Street Bridge is an element of the CPR trackage through the City of Oshawa, but it was built to serve the functional purpose of spanning the railway cut of the CPR, which precluded an at grade crossing. Therefore, it is not linked to its surroundings from a cultural heritage perspective.



Criteria of O. Reg. 9/06 (amended by O. Reg. 569/22)	Yes/No	Comments
9. Is a landmark	Yes	The Albert Street Bridge is a visually striking and prominent component of the Central Oshawa area. The timber deck, timber curbs, and timber barriers are notably memorable, conspicuous to users of the bridge, and easily discernible compared to other urban bridge crossings in the City of Oshawa and Regional Municipality of Durham.

2.2 Ontario Regulation 10/06

Table 2 provides the findings of the evaluation according to O. Reg. 10/06. A discussion of Albert Street Bridge which includes a provincial context is included in the CHER.

Table 2: O. Reg. 10/06 Evaluation

Criteria in O. Reg. 10/06	Yes/No	Comments
1. The property represents or demonstrates a theme or pattern in Ontario’s history.	No	The Albert Street Bridge was constructed to service a road that could not accommodate an at grade crossing due to the CPR line in this area being built through a cut. Although the CPR is associated with the transportation history of Ontario, the bridge itself does not demonstrate this theme in any particular way given its generic and formerly common design.
2. The property yields, or has the potential to yield, information that contributes to an understanding of Ontario’s history.	No	The Albert Street Bridge is a utilitarian bridge designed to service a collector north-south roadway in an urban area. It does not yield or have the potential to yield information that contributes to an understanding of Ontario’s history.



Addendum to Oshawa to Bowmanville Rail Service Extension Project: Cultural Heritage Evaluation Recommendations Report—Albert Street Bridge Evaluation

August 24, 2023

Criteria in O. Reg. 10/06	Yes/No	Comments
3. The property demonstrates an uncommon, rare or unique aspect of Ontario's cultural heritage.	No	While increasingly rare in the Regional Municipality of Durham and City of Oshawa, bridges with timber sections remain in service throughout Ontario, especially in more northern remote regions. The plate girder design remains common into the present-day. Hybrid timber stringer and plate girder bridges are not unique.
4. The property is of aesthetic, visual or contextual importance to the province.	No	The Albert Street Bridge is a utilitarian structure and was not designed or found to contain aesthetic value, symbolic value, or evoke an emotional response.
5. The property demonstrates a high degree of excellence or creative, technical or scientific achievement at a provincial level in a given period.	No	The timber stringer bridge is among the oldest bridge types in the world and the plate girder type of bridge remains common. Hybrid timber stringer and plate girder bridges were formerly common. Therefore, the bridge does not demonstrate a high degree of technical or scientific achievement at the provincial level.
6. The property has a strong or special association with the entire province or with a community that is found in more than one part of the province. The association exists for historic, social, or cultural reasons or because of traditional use.	No	Albert Street Bridge is not associated with a specific community or with traditional use of any kind. It is a utilitarian structure and not designed with symbolic or spiritual meaning.
7. The property has a strong or special association with the life or work of a person, group or organization of importance to the province or with an event of importance to the province.	No	The architect or designer of the bridge is unknown.



Criteria in O. Reg. 10/06	Yes/No	Comments
8. The property is located in unorganized territory and the Minister determines that there is a provincial interest in the protection of the property.	No	The property is located in the City of Oshawa, a lower-tier municipality within the Regional Municipality of Durham.

2.3 Recommended Outcome of Evaluation

A provincial heritage property (PHP) is a property that meets one or more criteria of O. Reg 9/06, and a provincial heritage property of provincial significance (PHPPS) must meet one or more criteria of O. Reg 10/06, regardless of the criteria met under O. Reg 9/06.

Based on the evaluation of the Albert Street Bridge against O. Reg 9/06 and O. Reg 10/06 it is recommended that the Albert Street Bridge be considered a PHP as it meets two criteria of O. Reg 9/06. The evaluation concluded that the Albert Street Bridge is a rare example of a hybrid bridge combining both the timber stringer bridge design and plate girder bridge design. The Albert Street Bridge is also a landmark structure within the Central Oshawa area. Therefore, the CHER recommends that the Albert Street Bridge be deemed a PHP.

In 2022, The Metrolinx Heritage Committee (MHC) made an interim decision that the Albert Street Bridge is a Provincial Heritage Property (PHP). This will be confirmed by MHC once Metrolinx owns, manages or controls the structure.



3.0 Draft Statement of Cultural Heritage Value or Interest

3.1 Description of the Property

Located in the City of Oshawa, in the Regional Municipality of Durham, the Albert Street Bridge is located between Albany Street and Olive Avenue. The bridge spans Fisher Street and the Canadian Pacific Railway (CPR) tracks. The bridge is a two-lane 14 span hybrid structure with a timber stringer and plate girder design and is open to pedestrian and vehicular traffic.

3.2 Statement of Cultural Heritage Value

The Albert Street Bridge is a 14-span hybrid structure containing timber stringer and plate girder sections. The timber stringer sections were constructed *circa* 1912 when the CPR was built through Oshawa. The bridge is a rare surviving example of a hybrid bridge design with timber stringer sections. The plate girder sections were built in about 1957 and remain a common design. Timber stringer bridges are among the oldest types of bridges in the world and were some of the first types of bridges built in North America. During the late 19th to mid-20th century, timber stringer bridges were supplanted by iron, steel, and concrete bridges.

The Albert Street Bridge is a visually striking landmark and prominent component of the Central Oshawa area. The timber deck, timber curbs, and timber barriers are notably memorable, conspicuous to users of the bridge, and easily discernible compared to other urban bridge crossings in the City of Oshawa and Region Municipality of Durham.



3.3 Heritage Attributes

- 14 span hybrid bridge with timber stringer and plate girder design
- Bridge superstructure, including
 - Laminated timber deck
 - Timber curbs
 - Timber barriers
 - Longitudinal timber floor beams
- Bridge substructure, including
 - Transverse timber beams
 - Transverse I-beam girders
 - Steel lateral bracing
 - Timber piers
 - Steel piers
 - Timber abutments



Closure

August 24, 2023

4.0 Closure


This report has been prepared for the sole benefit of the Metrolinx and may not be used by any third party without the express written consent of Stantec Consulting Ltd. Any use which a third party makes of this report is the responsibility of such third party.

We trust this report meets your current requirements. Please do not hesitate to contact us should you require further information or have additional questions about any facet of this report.

Stantec Consulting Ltd.

 Digitally signed by
Meaghan Rivard
Date: 2023.09.22
15:09:19 -04'00'

Meaghan Rivard MA, CAHP
Senior Heritage Consultant
Tel: (519) 645-3350
Cell: (226) 268-9025
meaghan.rivard@stantec.com

 Tracie Carmichael
2023.09.21
16:56:57 -04'00'

Tracie Carmichael BA, B.Ed.
Managing Principal, Environmental Services
Cell: (226) 927-3586
tracie.carmichael@stantec.com



References

August 24, 2023

5.0 References

Government of Ontario. 2006. *O. Reg. 10/06 Criteria for Determining Cultural Heritage Value or Interest of Provincial Significance*. Electronic Document: <https://www.ontario.ca/laws/regulation/060010>. Last accessed: January 20, 2023.

Government of Ontario. 2023. *O. Reg. 9/06 Criteria for Determining Cultural Heritage Value or Interest (amended by O. Reg 569/22)*. Electronic Document: <https://www.ontario.ca/laws/regulation/060009>. Last accessed: January 20, 2023.
Metrolinx. 2016. *Draft Terms of Reference for Consultants: Cultural Heritage Evaluation Report and Cultural Heritage Evaluation Report Recommendations*. On File at Stantec.

Ministry of Citizenship and Multiculturalism (MCM). 2010. *Standards & Guidelines for Conservation of Provincial Heritage Properties*. Electronic Document: http://www.mtc.gov.on.ca/en/publications/Standards_Consevation.pdf. Last accessed: October 22, 2021.

Stantec. 2023. *Addendum to Oshawa to Bowmanville Rail Service Extension: Cultural Heritage Report—Existing Conditions and Preliminary Impact Assessment*. On File at Metrolinx.

