

Appendix A7-8
Cultural Heritage Evaluation
Recommendations Report: 394 Simcoe
Street South, Oshawa





**Addendum to Oshawa to
Bowmanville Rail Service
Extension Project: Cultural
Heritage Evaluation
Recommendations Report—
394 Simcoe Street South**

Final Report

August 24, 2023



Prepared for:
Metrolinx
20 Bay Street, 6th Floor
Toronto, Ontario M5J 2W3

Prepared by:
Stantec Consulting Ltd.
600-171 Queens Avenue
London, Ontario N6A 5J7


Project Number:
165011019

Limitations and Sign-off

The conclusions in the Report titled Addendum to Oshawa to Bowmanville Rail Service Extension Project Cultural Heritage Evaluation Recommendations Report--394 Simcoe Street South are Stantec's professional opinion, as of the time of the Report, and concerning the scope described in the Report. The opinions in the document are based on conditions and information existing at the time the scope of work was conducted and do not take into account any subsequent changes. The Report relates solely to the specific project for which Stantec was retained and the stated purpose for which the Report was prepared. The Report is not to be used or relied on for any variation or extension of the project, or for any other project or purpose, and any unauthorized use or reliance is at the recipient's own risk.

Stantec has assumed all information received from Metrolinx (the "Client") and third parties in the preparation of the Report to be correct. While Stantec has exercised a customary level of judgment or due diligence in the use of such information, Stantec assumes no responsibility for the consequences of any error or omission contained therein.

This Report is intended solely for use by the Client in accordance with Stantec's contract with the Client. While the Report may be provided to applicable authorities having jurisdiction and others for whom the Client is responsible, Stantec does not warrant the services to any third party. The report may not be relied upon by any other party without the express written consent of Stantec, which may be withheld at Stantec's discretion.

Prepared by  Digitally signed
by Smith, Frank
Date: 2023.09.22
09:53:51 -04'00'

Frank Smith, MA, CAHP

Reviewed by  Digitally signed
by Jones, Lashia
Date: 2023.09.22
09:16:35 -04'00'

Lashia Jones, MA, CAHP

Approved by  Digitally signed by
Meaghan Rivard
Date: 2023.09.22
16:14:08 -04'00'

Meaghan Rivard, MA, CAHP



Executive Summary

Metrolinx retained Stantec Consulting Ltd. (Stantec) to prepare a Cultural Heritage Evaluation Report (CHER) for 394 Simcoe Street South in the City of Oshawa, Region of Durham. The property is a “Class B” listed property on the *Heritage Oshawa* inventory. Class B properties have “a good potential for designation” (City of Oshawa 2022). Metrolinx is proposing a property acquisition, temporary easement, and/or permanent easement on the property.

This report, the Cultural Heritage Evaluation Recommendation Report (CHERR) evaluates the property against the criteria of *Ontario Regulation 9/06* (O. Reg 9/06)¹ and *Ontario Regulation 10/06* (O. Reg 10/06) (Government of Ontario 2006a; Government of Ontario 2006b). The CHERR provides recommendations to the Metrolinx Heritage Committee regarding the level of cultural heritage significance (if any) of the potential resource. The CHERR was prepared by Frank Smith, MA, CAHP Cultural Heritage Specialist and Lashia Jones MA, CAHP, Senior Cultural Heritage Specialist.

The property at 394 Simcoe Street South is located on Part Lot C7, Sheet 22, Plan 335. This property contains a former residence that was built between approximately 1880 and 1898 based on the city heritage inventory, architectural details and land registry records. Between 1898, the residence was owned by J.D. Storie, a prominent industrialist in Oshawa. Storie died in 1936 and the property was heavily modified and converted to a hotel in 1946. The present-day structure at 394 Simcoe Street South is three storeys in height and contains an irregular roof with flat, gable, and mansard sections. The gable and mansard roof sections are clad in asphalt shingles and the cladding of the flat roof sections is not visible. The structure contains a red brick chimney. All four façades of the residence have been heavily modified by additions. The original foundation of the residence is not visible, and the additions have poured concrete foundations.

A provincial heritage property (PHP) is a property that meets one or more criteria of O. Reg 9/06, and a provincial heritage property of provincial significance (PHPPS) must meet one or more criteria of O. Reg. 10/06, regardless of the criteria met under O. Reg. 9/06. Based on the evaluation of the property against O. Reg 9/06 and O. Reg 10/06, the property contains no Cultural Heritage Value or Interest (CHVI) and is not a PHP or PHPPS.

¹ In 2023, O. Reg 9/06 was amended by O. Reg 569/22 (Government of Ontario 2023)



Addendum to Oshawa to Bowmanville Rail Service Extension Project: Cultural Heritage Evaluation Recommendations Report—394 Simcoe Street South
Executive Summary
 August 24, 2023

On February 16, 2023, the Metrolinx Heritage Committee (MHC) met to discuss the findings of the CHER and CHERR. The MHC determined that the property met no criteria of O. Reg. 9/06 or O. Reg. 10/06. Therefore, 394 Simcoe Street South is not a PHP or PPHPS.

The Executive Summary highlights key points from the report only; for complete information and findings, the reader should examine the complete report.

Document History

Revision	Description	Author	Quality Reviewer	Independent Reviewer
1 January 24, 2023	Draft Report	Frank Smith	Lashia Jones	Colin Varley
2 February 24, 2023	Revisions to Draft Report	Frank Smith	Lashia Jones	Colin Varley
3 March 31, 2023	Revisions to Draft Report	Frank Smith	Lashia Jones	Colin Varley
4 April 14, 2023	Revisions to Draft Report	Frank Smith	Lashia Jones	Meaghan Rivard
5 August 24, 2023	Final	Frank Smith	Lashia Jones	Meaghan Rivard



Table of Contents

Limitations and Sign-off	i
Executive Summary	ii
Project Personnel	v
Abbreviations	vi
1.0 Introduction	1
2.0 Evaluation	2
2.1 Ontario Regulation 9/06	2
2.2 Ontario Regulation 10/06.....	5
2.3 Recommended Outcome of Evaluation	6
3.0 Draft Statement of Cultural Heritage Value or Interest	7
4.0 References	8

List of Tables

Table 1: O. Reg 9/06 Evaluation.....	2
Table 2: O. Reg 10/06 Evaluation.....	5



Project Personnel

Project Manager:	Alex Blasko, B.Sc. (Hon.)
Report Writer:	Frank Smith, MA, CAHP
Fieldwork Technicians:	Frank Smith, MA, CAHP; Jenn Como, BA
GIS Specialist:	Brandon Fonseca
Administrative Assistant:	Sarah Hilker
Quality Reviewer:	Lashia Jones, MA, CAHP
Independent Reviewer:	Colin Varley, MA, RPA



Abbreviations

BA	Bachelor of Arts
CAHP	Canadian Association of Heritage Professionals
CHER	Cultural Heritage Evaluation Report
CHVI	Cultural Heritage Value or Interest
CPR	Canadian Pacific Railway
MA	Master of Arts
MCM	Ministry of Citizenship and Multiculturalism
MHC	Metrolinx Heritage Committee
OHA	Ontario Heritage Act
OHT	Ontario Heritage Trust
O. Reg.	Ontario Regulation
PHP	Provincial Heritage Property
PHPSS	Provincial Heritage Property of Provincial Significance



1.0 Introduction

Metrolinx retained Stantec Consulting Ltd. (Stantec) to prepare a Cultural Heritage Evaluation Report (CHER) for 394 Simcoe Street South in the City of Oshawa, Region of Durham. The property is a “Class B” listed property on the *Heritage Oshawa* inventory. Class B properties have “a good potential for designation” (City of Oshawa 2022). Metrolinx is proposing a property acquisition, temporary easement, and/or permanent easement on the property.

The CHER was prepared in accordance with the *Draft Metrolinx Terms of Reference for Cultural Heritage Evaluation Reports and Cultural Heritage Evaluation Report Recommendations* and the Ministry of Citizenship and Multiculturalism (MCM) *Standards and Guidelines for the Conservation of Provincial Heritage* (OHA Standards and Guidelines) (Metrolinx 2016; MCM 2010).

The CHER is divided into a Cultural Heritage Evaluation Report and Cultural Heritage Evaluation Recommendation Report. This report, the Cultural Heritage Evaluation Recommendation Report (CHERR) evaluates 394 Simcoe Street South against the criteria of *Ontario Regulation 9/06* (O. Reg 9/06)² and *Ontario Regulation 10/06* (O. Reg 10/06) (; Government of Ontario 2006; Government of Ontario 2023). The CHERR provides recommendations to the Metrolinx Heritage Committee regarding the level of cultural heritage significance (if any) of the potential resource.

The property at 394 Simcoe Street South is located on Part Lot C7, Sheet 22, Plan 335. This property contains a residence that was built between approximately 1882 and 1891 based on the city heritage inventory, architectural style and land registry records. Between 1898 and 1936 the residence was owned by J.D. Storie, a prominent industrialist in Oshawa. Storie died in 1936 and the property was heavily modified and converted to a hotel in 1946.

The present-day structure at 394 Simcoe Street South is three storeys in height and contains an irregular roof with flat, gable, and mansard sections. The gable and mansard roof sections are clad in asphalt shingles and the cladding of the flat roof sections is not visible. The structure contains a red brick chimney. All four facades of the residence have been heavily modified by additions. The original foundation of the residence is not visible, and the additions have a poured concrete foundation.

² In 2023, O. Reg 9/06 was amended by O. Reg 569/22 (Government of Ontario 2023)



2.0 Evaluation

2.1 Ontario Regulation 9/06

Table 1 provides the findings of the evaluation according to O. Reg. 9/06. A discussion of the design/physical value, historical and associative value, and contextual value of 394 Simcoe Street South is contained in the CHER.

Table 1: O. Reg. 9/06 Evaluation

Criteria of O. Reg. 9/06 (amended by O. Reg. 569/22)	Yes/No	Comments
1. The property has design value or physical value because it is a rare, unique, representative or early example of a style, type, expression, material or construction method	No	The structure at 394 Simcoe Street South has been modified to the extent that it has no heritage integrity from a design and physical perspective. While some Queen Anne elements remain, they are visually overwhelmed by the additions and modifications to the extent that the residence cannot be considered a representative, rare, or unique example of the Queen Anne style of architecture.
2. The property has design value or physical value because it displays a high degree of craftsmanship or artistic merit.	No	The structure contains low heritage integrity and remaining Queen Anne elements are typical to the style in terms of materials and execution.
3. The property has design value or physical value because it demonstrates a high degree of technical or scientific achievement.	No	The structure is a heavily modified brick residence that does not demonstrate technical expertise in its construction methods.



Addendum to Oshawa to Bowmanville Rail Service Extension Project: Cultural Heritage Evaluation Recommendations Report—394 Simcoe Street South Evaluation
 August 24, 2023

Criteria of O. Reg. 9/06 (amended by O. Reg. 569/22)	Yes/No	Comments
<p>4. The property has historical value or associative value because it has direct associations with a theme, event, belief, person, activity, organization or institution that is significant to a community.</p>	<p>No</p>	<p>The original sections of the structure are the former residence of J.D. Storie, a prominent citizen of the City of Oshawa who contributed to its early 20th century development. However, the association with J.D. Storie is no longer direct as the building no longer exemplifies the Queen Anne residence that would have been occupied during the time period associated with J.D. Storie.</p> <p>The Cadillac Hotel was one of several hotels, bars, and later music venues in the City of Oshawa during the mid-20th century and late 20th century. The Cadillac Hotel did not make a strong or notable contribution to the development of the city or an organization or activity significant to the city. While the hotel had a reputation for booking local talent, this was one of several venues in the city and historical research does not indicate it played a particularly significant role in fostering local talent.</p>
<p>5. The property has historical value or associative value because it yields, or has the potential to yield, information that contributes to an understanding of a community or culture.</p>	<p>No</p>	<p>The structure has been significantly modified and remains occupied. It does not offer new knowledge or a greater understanding of the City of Oshawa or one of its communities.</p>
<p>6. The property has historical value or associative value because it demonstrates or reflects the work or ideas of an architect, artist, builder, designer or theorist who is significant to a community.</p>	<p>No</p>	<p>The architect or builder is unknown.</p>



**Addendum to Oshawa to Bowmanville Rail Service Extension Project: Cultural Heritage
Evaluation Recommendations Report—394 Simcoe Street South
Evaluation**
August 24, 2023

Criteria of O. Reg. 9/06 (amended by O. Reg. 569/22)	Yes/No	Comments
7. The property has contextual value because it is important in defining, maintaining or supporting the character of an area.	No	Simcoe Street South and Avenue Street are mixed streetscapes without a unique or definable character.
8. The property has contextual value because it is physically, functionally, visually or historically linked to its surroundings.	No	The structure is not physically, visually, or historically linked to its surroundings. While the location of the Cadillac Hotel may have been influenced by the nearby CPR station, the CPR trackage was built over 30 years before the opening of the hotel and the hotel continued to operate after the CPR ended passenger service on the line. Therefore, the relationship between the Cadillac Hotel and CPR is not important to understanding the broader context of the property.
9. The property has contextual value because it is a landmark.	No	The property contains one of several mixed-use and modified late 19 th to early 20 th century structures on Simcoe Street South. It is not especially memorable or discernible.



2.2 Ontario Regulation 10/06

Table 2 provides the findings of the evaluation according to O. Reg. 10/06. A discussion of 394 Simcoe Street South which includes a provincial context is included in the CHER.

Table 2: O. Reg 10/06 Evaluation

Criteria in O. Reg. 10/06	Yes/No	Comments
1. The property represents or demonstrates a theme or pattern in Ontario’s history.	No	The property contains a former residence and hotel. These types of structures are common in Ontario and the property does not contribute to an influential evolution or pattern of development in Ontario.
2. The property yields, or has the potential to yield, information that contributes to an understanding of Ontario’s history.	No	The property contains a former residence and hotel. These types of structures are common in Ontario and the property does not have the potential to yield information that contributes to a greater understanding of Ontario’s history.
3. The property demonstrates an uncommon, rare or unique aspect of Ontario’s cultural heritage.	No	Queen Anne style architecture was common in Ontario during the late 19 th and early 20 th century and many examples remain in the province. Most significant communities in the province also contained a hotel or tavern. Therefore, the property is not uncommon or rare within Ontario.
4. The property is of aesthetic, visual or contextual importance to the province.	No	The property does not contain vantage points or views that are essential to the visual setting and the property was not designed to evoke an emotional response.
5. The property demonstrates a high degree of excellence or creative, technical or scientific achievement at a provincial level in a given period.	No	The property contains a highly modified Queen Anne style former residence. The original sections of the residence use typical late 19 th century construction methods and the mid-20 th century additions are utilitarian. They do not demonstrate excellence from a technical perspective at the provincial level.



Criteria in O. Reg. 10/06	Yes/No	Comments
6. The property has a strong or special association with the entire province or with a community that is found in more than one part of the province. The association exists for historic, social, or cultural reasons or because of traditional use.	No	The property was not found to have important symbolic, historical, social, or cultural meaning within the province or with a community that is found within more than one part of the province.
7. The property has a strong or special association with the life or work of a person, group or organization of importance to the province or with an event of importance to the province.	No	While the property was associated with J.D. Storie, his association with the property is no longer direct due to the extensive modifications. In addition, while Storie contributed to the development of Oshawa, his contributions are limited to the development of Oshawa.
8. The property is located in unorganized territory and the Minister determines that there is a provincial interest in the protection of the property.	No	The property is located in the City of Oshawa, Region of Durham.

2.3 Recommended Outcome of Evaluation

A provincial heritage property (PHP) is a property that meets one or more criteria of O. Reg 9/06, and a provincial heritage property of provincial significance (PHPPS) must meet one or more criteria of O. Reg. 10/06, regardless of the criteria met under O. Reg. 9/06.

Based on the outcome of the evaluation, the property does not contain CHVI and is not a PHP or PHPPS.

On February 16, 2023, the Metrolinx Heritage Committee (MHC) met to discuss the findings of the CHER and CHERR. The MHC determined that the property met no criteria of O. Reg. 9/06 or O. Reg. 10/06. Therefore, 394 Simcoe Street South is not a PHP or PHPPS.



3.0 Draft Statement of Cultural Heritage Value or Interest

The property has not been found to contain CHVI and a draft statement of CHVI is not applicable given the findings of the CHRR.



4.0 References

- City of Oshawa. 2022. *Heritage Properties*. Electronic Document:
<https://www.oshawa.ca/en/parks-recreation-and-culture/heritage-properties.aspx>.
Last Accessed: January 20, 2023.
- Government of Ontario. 2006. *O. Reg. 10/06 Criteria for Determining Cultural Heritage Value or Interest of Provincial Significance*. Electronic Document:
<https://www.ontario.ca/laws/regulation/060010>. Last accessed: January 20, 2023.
- Government of Ontario. 2023. *O. Reg. 9/06 Criteria for Determining Cultural Heritage Value or Interest (amended by O. Reg 569/22)*. Electronic Document:
<https://www.ontario.ca/laws/regulation/060009>. Last accessed: January 20, 2023
- Metrolinx. 2016. *Draft Terms of Reference for Consultants: Cultural Heritage Evaluation Report and Cultural Heritage Evaluation Report Recommendations*. On File at Stantec.
- Ministry of Citizenship and Multiculturalism (MCM). 2010. *Standards & Guidelines for Conservation of Provincial Heritage Properties*. Electronic Document:
http://www.mtc.gov.on.ca/en/publications/Standards_Conservation.pdf. Last accessed: January 20, 2023.

